



FOOD INGREDIENTS AND PACKAGING UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

### MINUTES OF THE 9<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON GUIDANCE UPDATE ON FLAVOURINGS

**Held on 12-14 January 2021 by web-conference**

**(Agreed on 25 January 2021)**

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi (3rd day), Polly Boon (1st day), Kevin Chipman, Karl-Heinz Engel (Chair), Rainer Gürtler (2nd and 3rd days), Wim Mennes, Ullrika Sahlin
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
None
- European Commission representatives (DG SANTE):  
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell, Milada Schulzova, Jiri Sochor (1st day).
- EFSA:  
FIP Unit: Stefania Barmaz (2nd day), Maria Carfì (2nd and 3rd days), Esraa Elewa (2nd and 3rd days), Carla Martino, Alexandra Tard (1st day) and Giorgia Vianello (1st day).  
DATA Unit: Davide Arcella (1st day)

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Joop De Knecht.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 8<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 1-2 December 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 8<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 17<sup>th</sup> December 2020.<sup>4</sup>

## 5. Scientific topics for discussion

### 5.1. Update of EFSA guidance on the assessment of smoke flavourings (EFSA-Q-2019-00687)<sup>5</sup>

The Working Group received feedback from the discussion held at the FAF Panel meeting held on 15-16 December 2020 and updated the draft guidance document accordingly.

A revised text of the draft guidance was agreed which will be submitted for discussion and possible adoption at the next FAF Panel plenary meeting on 26-28 January. The need to consult with hearing experts in the field of immunotoxicology during the next FAF plenary meeting was also identified.

At the current meeting, the Working Group also finalised the responses to the comments received by the interested parties during the public consultation on the draft guidance carried out from 5 October to 16 November 2020. A technical report including the outcome of the public consultation (EFSA-Q-2020-00398) will be also distributed to the FAF Panel for possible endorsement at its January plenary meeting.

## 6. Any Other Business

None.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg-fip-guidance-update-flavourings.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00687>

## **7. Next meetings**

17 February 2021 by web-conference, tbc.



FOOD INGREDIENTS AND PACKAGING UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

### MINUTES OF THE 8<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON GUIDANCE UPDATE ON FLAVOURINGS

**Held on 1-2 December 2020 by web-conference**

**(Agreed on 17 December 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi (1st day), Polly Boon (1st day), Kevin Chipman, Karl-Heinz Engel (Chair), Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes, Ullrika Sahlin
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
None
- European Commission representatives (DG SANTE):  
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (1st day), Jiri Sochor (1st day), Milada Schulzova (1st day)
- EFSA:  
FIP Unit: Stefania Barmaz (2nd day), Ana Campos Fernandes (1st day), Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi, Alexandra Tard (1st day) and Giorgia Vianello (2nd day).  
DATA Unit: Davide Arcella (1st day)

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Joop De Knecht.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 2-4 September 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 7<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 21<sup>st</sup> September 2020.<sup>4</sup>

## 5. Scientific topics for discussion

### 5.1. Update of EFSA guidance on the assessment of smoke flavourings (EFSA-Q-2019-00687)<sup>5</sup>

Further to the endorsement of the draft guidance by the FAF Panel at its 16<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting open to observers and held on 21-23 September 2020, a public consultation was launched on 5 October 2020 and kept open until 16 November 2020. During the public consultation a technical hearing with interested parties was also organised by EFSA on 5<sup>th</sup> November 2020 as virtual meeting.

At the current meeting, the Working Group addressed the comments received on the draft guidance by the interested parties during the public consultation and the technical hearing and started elaborating the text of the draft guidance in the light of the comments received.

It was agreed to consult with the FAF Panel during the plenary meeting on 15-16 December with respect to the assessment of some of the comments received during the public consultation. Based on the feedback from the FAF Panel, the draft guidance will be further elaborated and discussed at a coming Working Group meeting.

## 6. Any Other Business

None.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg-fip-guidance-update-flavourings.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00687>

## **7. Next meetings**

12-14 January 2021 by web-conference.



FOOD INGREDIENTS AND PACKAGING UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

### MINUTES OF THE 7<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON GUIDANCE UPDATE ON FLAVOURINGS

**Held on 2-4 September 2020 by web-conference**

**(Agreed on 21 September 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Polly Boon, Kevin Chipman, Joop De Knecht (2nd day), Karl-Heinz Engel (Chair), Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes (1st and 2nd day), Ullrika Sahlin
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
None
- European Commission representatives:  
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE), Jiri Sochor (DG SANTE), Milada Schulzova (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:  
FIP Unit: Stefania Barmaz (2nd day), Ana Campos Fernandes, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi (1st day), Alexandra Tard (1st and 2nd day) and Giorgia Vianello (3rd day). DATA Unit: Davide Arcella (1st day)

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies were received.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 8-10 June 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 6<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 29<sup>th</sup> June 2020.<sup>4</sup>

## 5. Scientific topics for discussion

### 5.1. Update of EFSA guidance on the assessment of smoke flavourings (EFSA-Q-2019-00687)<sup>5</sup>

Further to the consultation with the FAF Panel at its 15<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting on 30 June - 2 July, the Working Group discussed the revised draft guidance document in which the feedback of the FAF Panel was addressed.

A final text of the draft guidance was agreed which will be scheduled for discussion and possible endorsement for public consultation at the next FAF Panel plenary meeting open for observers on 21 September.

## 6. Any Other Business

None.

## 7. Next meetings

To be confirmed.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg-fip-guidance-update-flavourings.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-O-2019-00687>





## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

### MINUTES OF THE 6<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON GUIDANCE UPDATE ON FLAVOURINGS

**Held on 8-10 June 2020 by web-conference**

**(Agreed on 29 June 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Kevin Chipman (2nd day), Joop De Knecht (2nd day), Karl-Heinz Engel (Chair), Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes, Ullrika Sahlin
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Paul Fowler (2nd day), Andy Hart (3rd day), Vibe Meister Beltoft, Karin Kristiane Nørby and Ine Waalkens-Berendsen (2nd day)
- European Commission representatives:  
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:  
FIP Unit: Stefania Barmaz (2nd and 3rd day), Ana Campos Fernandes (1st day), Maria Carfì, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi (2nd and 3rd day) and Alexandra Tard (1st day)  
FEED Unit: Paola Manini

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants and particularly Paul Fowler and Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, invited on 9<sup>th</sup> June as hearing experts in the field of developmental and reproductive toxicity and Andy Hart invited on 10<sup>th</sup> June as hearing expert in the area of uncertainty analyses.

Apologies were received from Polly Boon.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 18-19 May 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 5<sup>th</sup> June 2020.<sup>4</sup>

## 5. Scientific topics for discussion

### 5.1. Update of EFSA guidance on the assessment of smoke flavourings (EFSA-Q-2019-00687)<sup>5</sup>

The Working Group continued the discussion on a revised draft of the guidance document and further elaborated on the approach to be developed.

Tasks were allocated among Working Group members with the view to finalise a consolidated draft guidance document which will be scheduled for discussion at the next FAF Panel plenary meeting on 30 June - 2 July.

Feedback received from the FAF Panel will be further elaborated and discussed at the next WG meeting.

## 6. Any Other Business

None.

## 7. Next meetings

2-3 September 2020 by web-conference (tbc).

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq-fip-guidance-update-flavourings.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00687>



FOOD INGREDIENTS AND PACKAGING UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

### MINUTES OF THE 5<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON GUIDANCE UPDATE ON FLAVOURINGS

**Held on 18-19 May 2020 by web-conference**

**(Agreed on 5 June 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:

Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi (2nd day), Polly Boon (1st day), Kevin Chipman, Joop De Knecht (1st day), Karl-Heinz Engel (Chair), Rainer Gürtler (2nd day), Wim Mennes (1st day), Ullrika Sahlin

- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:

None

- European Commission representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)

- EFSA:

FIP Unit: Stefania Barmaz (1st day), Ana Campos Fernandes (1st day), Maria Carfı (2nd day), Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Alexandra Tard (1st day) and Giorgia Vianello

FEED Unit: Paola Manini

DATA Unit: Davide Arcella (1st day)

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants and particularly Joop De Knecht, recently appointed as a new member of this WG. No apologies were received.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting held on 20-22 April 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 8<sup>th</sup> May 2020.<sup>4</sup>

## 5. Scientific topics for discussion

### 5.1. Update of EFSA guidance on the assessment of smoke flavourings (EFSA-Q-2019-00687)<sup>5</sup>

The members of the Working Group were informed about the feedback received on the draft guidance document at the 14<sup>th</sup> FAF Panel plenary meeting on 12-14 May.

The Working Group continued the discussion on a revised draft of the guidance document and further elaborated on the approach to be developed.

Tasks were allocated among Working Group members in advance to the next meeting.

The need to invite at a next WG meeting hearing experts in the field of developmental and reproductive toxicity was identified.

## 6. Any Other Business

None.

## 7. Next meetings

8-10 June 2020 by web-conference.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq-fip-guidance-update-flavourings.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00687>



FOOD INGREDIENTS AND PACKAGING UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

### MINUTES OF THE 4<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON GUIDANCE UPDATE ON FLAVOURINGS

**Held on 20-22 April 2020 by web-conference**

**(Agreed on 8 May 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Romualdo Benigni (2nd and 3rd day), Claudia Bolognesi (2nd and 3rd day), Polly Boon (1st and 2nd day), Kevin Chipman, Karl-Heinz Engel (Chair), Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes, Ullrika Sahlin (1st and 2nd day)
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Vibe Meister Beltoft (1st and 2nd day), Peter Fürst (3rd day)
- European Commission representatives:  
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:  
FIP Unit: Stefania Barmaz, Ana Campos Fernandes (1st and 2nd day), Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi, Alexandra Tard (1st and 2nd day) and Giorgia Vianello (2nd and 3rd day)  
FEED Unit: Paola Manini (1st and 2nd day)  
DATA Unit: Davide Arcella (1st and 2nd day)

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a web-conference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection.

The Chair welcomed the participants.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 20<sup>th</sup> March 2020.<sup>4</sup>

## 5. Scientific topics for discussion

### 5.1. Update of EFSA guidance on the assessment of smoke flavourings (EFSA-Q-2019-00687)<sup>5</sup>

The Working Group continued the discussion on the draft updated guidance document and further elaborated on the approach to be developed.

It was agreed to provide an initial feedback on the key principles and the general approach that have been followed so far in the development of the updated guidance document to the coming plenary meeting of the FAF Panel on 12-14 May. Based on the feedback received from the FAF Panel, the draft document will be further elaborated and discussed at a coming WG meeting.

## 6. Any Other Business

None.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq-fip-guidance-update-flavourings.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00687>

## 7. Next meetings

18-19 May 2020 by web-conference.



FOOD INGREDIENTS AND PACKAGING UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

### MINUTES OF THE 3<sup>rd</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON GUIDANCE UPDATE ON FLAVOURINGS

**Held on 3 March 2020 by web-conference**

**(Agreed on 20 March 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Polly Boon, Kevin Chipman, Karl-Heinz Engel (Chair), Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes, Ullrika Sahlin.
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Vibe Meister Beltoft
- European Commission representatives:  
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:  
FIP Unit: Stefania Barmaz, Ana Campos Fernandes, Maria Carfì, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Alexandra Tard and Giorgia Vianello  
DATA Unit: Davide Arcella

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a web-conference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection.

The Chair welcomed the participants and particularly Ullrika Sahlin, recently appointed as a new member of this WG. No apologies were received.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Working Group meeting held on 14 January 2020, Parma

The minutes of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 31<sup>st</sup> January 2020.<sup>4</sup>

## 5. Scientific topics for discussion

### 5.1. Update of EFSA guidance on the assessment of smoke flavourings (EFSA-Q-2019-00687)<sup>5</sup>

The Working Group discussed an initial draft of the updated guidance document as developed since the last meeting. Ullrika Sahlin, appointed as a new member of this Working Group in view of her expertise on uncertainty analysis, also contributed to the discussion.

Based on the comments made on the different sections of the guidance document, the draft will be further elaborated and discussed at a coming WG meeting. Accordingly, the experts were assigned with new tasks.

The need of additional expertise in the Working Group in the field of environmental safety was identified.

## 6. Any Other Business

None.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg-fip-guidance-update-flavourings.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00687>

## **7. Next meetings**

20-22 April 2020, Parma (tbc).



FOOD INGREDIENTS AND PACKAGING UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

### MINUTES OF THE 2<sup>nd</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON GUIDANCE UPDATE ON FLAVOURINGS

**Held on 14 January 2020, Parma**

**(Agreed on 31 January 2020)**

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Polly Boon, Kevin Chipman, Karl-Heinz Engel (Chair), Wim Mennes.  
Rainer Gürtler participated via teleconference
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission representatives:  
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE) participated via teleconference
- EFSA:  
FEED Unit: Paola Manini  
FIP Unit: Stefania Barmaz, Maria Carfì, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello  
SCER Unit: Caroline Merten

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 10 December 2019, Parma

The minutes of the 1<sup>st</sup> Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 20<sup>th</sup> December 2019.<sup>4</sup>

## 5. Scientific topics for discussion

### 5.1. Update of EFSA guidance on the assessment of smoke flavourings (EFSA-Q-2019-00687)<sup>5</sup>

The Working Group discussed the key principles and the general approach that will be followed in the development of the updated guidance document. A Table of Contents for the draft guidance was presented and agreed. An initial draft of the different sections of the updated guidance will be developed and discussed at a coming WG meeting.

## 6. Any Other Business

None.

## 7. Next meetings

3 March 2020, Parma.

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg-fip-guidance-update-flavourings.pdf>

<sup>5</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00687>



FOOD INGREDIENTS AND PACKAGING UNIT

## SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

### MINUTES OF THE 1<sup>ST</sup> MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON GUIDANCE UPDATE ON FLAVOURINGS

**Held on 10 December 2019, Parma**

**(Agreed on 20 December 2019)**

#### Participants

- Working Group Members:  
Claudia Bolognesi, Karl-Heinz Engel (Chair), Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes.  
Kevin Chipman, Romualdo Benigni and Polly Boon have participated via teleconference
- Hearing Experts<sup>1</sup>:  
Not Applicable
- European Commission representatives:  
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE) participated via teleconference
- EFSA:  
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi, Alexandra Tard and Giorgia Vianello  
Esraa Elewa has participated via teleconference  
DATA Unit: Davide Arcella

---

<sup>1</sup> As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

## 1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

## 2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence<sup>2</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management<sup>3</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

## 4. Scientific topics for discussion

### 4.1. Update of EFSA guidance on the assessment of smoke flavourings (EFSA-Q-2019-00687)<sup>4</sup>

The Working Group discussed the Terms of Reference (ToR) of the mandate received from the Commission requesting to prepare an updated and consolidated guidance for the submission of applications on smoke flavouring primary products under Regulations (EC) No 2065/2003 and No 1321/2013. The Working Group examined the content of the current EFSA guidance documents on smoke flavourings (i.e. EFSA, 2005<sup>5</sup>; EFSA, 2009<sup>6</sup> and EFSA, 2010<sup>7</sup>) and started identifying those areas that need revision in the light of the experience gained with the assessment of the smoke flavourings authorised in the European Union and taking into account the relevant cross-sectional guidance and new scientific requirements published by EFSA since the adoption of the above mentioned guidance related to the safety of smoke flavourings.

## 5. Any Other Business

None.

## 6. Next meetings

14 January 2020, Parma

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2019-00687>

<sup>5</sup> EFSA Panel on Food Additives, Flavourings, Processing Aids and Materials in Contact with Food, 2005. Guidance on submission of a dossier on a Smoke Flavouring Primary Product for evaluation by EFSA. EFSA Journal 2005; 3(4):492, 8 pp. doi: 10.2903/j.efsa.2005.492

<sup>6</sup> Scientific Opinion of the Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing aids (CEF) on Dietary exposure assessment methods for smoke flavouring Primary Products. The EFSA Journal (2009) RN-284, 1-30.

<sup>7</sup> EFSA Panel on Food Contact Material, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids; Statement on the Safety Evaluation of Smoke Flavourings, Primary Products: Interpretation of the Margin of Safety; EFSA Journal 2010; 8(1): 1325, 7 pp. doi: 10.2903/j.efsa.2009.1325