



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 26th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 11th February 2021 by web-conference

(Agreed on 26th February 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Romualdo Benigni, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes (chair) and Camilla Svendsen.
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell, Jiri Sochor, Milada Schulzova
- EFSA: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf.



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 25th Working Group meeting held on 3rd December 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 25th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 18th December 2020.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 2-Hydroxy-4-methoxybenzaldehyde (EFSA-Q-2020-00573)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.2 E-3-benzo[1,3]dioxol-5-yl-N,N-diphenyl-2-propenamide (EFSA-Q-2020-00572)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5 Any Other Business

None.

6 Next meeting

13-14 April 2021, web-conference.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq_flavouringsFAF.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 25th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 3rd December 2020 by web-conference

(Agreed on 18 December 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Romualdo Benigni, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes (Chair) and Camilla Svendsen.
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
None
- EFSA:
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Ana Campos Fernandes, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi, Alexandra Tard and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 24th Working Group meeting held on 11th and 12th November 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 24th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 27th November 2020.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Prosmoke BW 01 (EFSA-Q-2019-00441)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5 Any Other Business

None

6 Next meeting

10-11 February 2021, web-conference.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq_flavouringsFAF.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 24th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 11-12th November 2020 by web-conference

(Agreed on 27 November 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Romualdo Benigni, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes (Chair) and Camilla Svendsen.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Karin Kristiane Nørby
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell, Milada Schulzova and Jiri Sochor (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting held on 6th and 8th October 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 20th October 2020.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 FGE.67Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00853, EFSA-Q-2013-00855 to EFSA-Q-2013-00859, EFSA-Q-2014-00388, EFSA-Q-2014-00389, EFSA-Q-2014-00416, EFSA-Q-2014-00417, EFSA-Q-2014-00419, EFSA-Q-2014-00420)- FGE.13Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to -00422)

The draft scientific opinions were discussed by the WG.

The revised draft opinion FGE.67Rev3 will be presented at the 17th FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

The revised draft opinion FGE.13Rev3 will be presented at the 18th FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

5.2 2-Hydroxy-4-methoxybenzaldehyde (EFSA-Q-2020-00573)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.3 Prosmoke BW 01 (EFSA-Q-2019-00441)

The WG had an initial discussion on the new data submitted by the applicant in response to EFSA's request for additional information. The dossier will be further evaluated at the next WG meeting.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavoursFAF.pdf



5 Any Other Business

The WG was informed about the technical hearing with interested parties organised by EFSA on the draft scientific guidance on the preparation of applications on smoke flavouring primary products which was held on 5th November as virtual meeting.

6 Next meeting

3rd December 2020, web-conference.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 23rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 6th and 8th October 2020 by web-conference

(Agreed on 20 October 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Romualdo Benigni, Kevin Chipman, Gisela Degen, Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes (Chair), Camilla Svendsen.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Karin Kristiane Nørby
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell and Jiri Sochor (DG SANTE) participated on 6th October
- EFSA:
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 22nd Working Group meeting held on 26th August 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 22nd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 10th September 2020.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.67Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00853, EFSA-Q-2013-00855 to EFSA-Q-2013-00859, EFSA-Q-2014-00388, EFSA-Q-2014-00389, EFSA-Q-2014-00416, EFSA-Q-2014-00417, EFSA-Q-2014-00419, EFSA-Q-2014-00420) - FGE.13Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to -00422)

The dossiers were discussed and will be further evaluated at the next WG meeting.

6. Any Other Business

None.

7. Next meeting

11, 12 November 2020, web-conference.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq_flavouringsFAF.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 22nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 26th August 2020 by web-conference

(Agreed on 10 September 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Romualdo Benigni, Kevin Chipman, Gisela Degen, Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes (Chair), Camilla Svendsen.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Karin Kristiane Nørby
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Fowler.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 15 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/expertselection.pdf.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting held on 7-8 July 2020, by web-conference

The minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 24th July 2020.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.67Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00853 to -00859, EFSA-Q-2014-00388, EFSA-Q-2014-00389, EFSA-Q-2014-00416, EFSA-Q-2014-00417, EFSA-Q-2014-00419 and EFSA-Q-2014-00420) - FGE.13Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to -00422)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next WG meeting.

5.2. FGE.76Rev2 (EFSA-Q-2014-00675 to -00679, EFSA-Q-2014-00682 and EFSA-Q-2014-00683) and FGE.21Rev6 (EFSA-Q-2014-00680 and -00681)

This item was not discussed due to lack of time.

5 Any Other Business

None.

6 Next meeting

6 and 8 October 2020, web-conference.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavouringsFAF.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 21ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 7-8 July 2020, by web-conference

(Agreed on 24 July 2020)

Participants

■ Working Group Members

Gabriele Aquilina, Romualdo Benigni, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes (Chair), Camilla Svendsen.

■ Hearing Experts¹:

None

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)

■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Claudia Bolognesi and Kevin Chipman.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting held on 15 May 2020, Parma

The minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 5th June 2020.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.67Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00853 to EFSA-Q-2013-00859, EFSA-Q-2014-00388 and -00389 and EFSA-Q-2014-00416 to EFSA-Q-2014-00420) - FGE.13Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to -00422)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.2. FGE.69Rev1 – (EFSA-Q-2019-00742 to -00744)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG. The revised draft opinion will be presented at the next FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

5 Any Other Business

None.

6 Next meeting

26 August 2020, web-conference.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavouringsFAF.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 20TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 15 May 2020, by web-conference

(Agreed on 5 June 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members

Gabriele Aquilina, Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes (Chair), Camilla Svendsen.

- Hearing Experts¹:

Vibe Meister Beltoft

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)

- EFSA:

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Fowler.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting held on 22-23 April 2020, Parma

The minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 7th May 2020.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.76Rev2 (EFSA-Q-2014-00675 to -00679, EFSA-Q-2014-00682, EFSA-Q-2014-00683) and FGE.21Rev6 (EFSA-Q-2014-00680 and -00681)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next WG meeting.

5.2. FGE.67Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00853 to EFSA-Q-2013-00859, EFSA-Q-2014-00388 to -00389 and EFSA-Q-2014-00416 to EFSA-Q-2014-00420) and FGE.13Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to -00422)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next WG meeting.

5.3. FGE.69Rev1 (EFSA-Q-2019-00742 to -00744)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next WG meeting.

5 Any Other Business

None.

6 Next meeting

7-8 July 2020, web-conference.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq_flavouringsFAF.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 19TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 22-23 April 2020, by web-conference

(Agreed on 07 May 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members

Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes (Chair), Camilla Svendsen.

- Hearing Experts¹:

Vibe Meister Beltoft

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)

- EFSA:

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Gabriele Aquilina.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting held on 7th April 2020, Parma

The minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 17th April 2020.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.91Rev3 – (EFSA-Q-2018-00839 and -00840; EFSA-Q-2020-0015 to -0023 and EFSA-Q-2020-00266)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG. The revised draft opinion will be presented to the next FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

5.2. FGE. 67 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00853 to EFSA-Q-2013-00859, EFSA-Q-2014-00388 and -00389 and EFSA-Q-2014-00416 to EFSA-Q-2014-00420) - FGE.13 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to -00422)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

FGE. 69Rev1 – (EFSA-Q-2019-00742 to -00744)

This item was not discussed due to lack of time.

5 Any Other Business

None.

6 Next meeting

15th May 2020, web-conference.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavouringsFAF.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 18TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 7 April 2020 by web-conference

(Agreed on 17 April 2020)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Gabriele Aquilina, Claudia Bolognesi, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Rainer Gürtler, Daniel Marzin and Wim Mennes (Chair).

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)

■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa and Carla Martino

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting held on 4-5 March 2020 and of minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 17th March 2020 by web-conference

The minutes of the 16th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 25th March 2020³.

The minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 27th March 2020³.

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1. FGE.67 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00853 to EFSA-Q-2013-00859, EFSA-Q-2014-00388 and -00389 and EFSA-Q-2014-00416 to EFSA-Q-2014-00420) and FGE.13 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to -00422)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next WG meeting.

6. Any Other Business

None.

7. Next meeting

22-23 April 2020, web-conference.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/food-ingredients-and-packaging/working-groups>



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 17TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 17th March 2020 by web-conference

(Agreed on 27th March 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members
Romualdo Benigni, Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes (Chair).
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavouringsFAF.pdf



issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1. FGE.63Rev4 (EFSA-Q-2019-00401, EFSA-Q-2019-00453 to -00456, EFSA-Q-2019-00458, EFSA-Q-2019-00460, EFSA-Q-2019-00463 to -00465, EFSA-Q-2019-00475 to -00478)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

4.2. FGE.07Rev6 (EFSA-Q-2018-00838, EFSA-Q-2019-00451 and -00452)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5 Any Other Business

None

6 Next meeting

7 April 2020, WEB-conference.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 16TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 4-5 March 2020 by web-conference

(Agreed on 25 March 2020)

Participants

■ Working Group Members

Gabriele Aquilina, Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Wim Mennes (Chair), Camilla Svendsen.

Karl-Heinz Engel participated in agenda items 5.1 and 5.4.

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Vibe Meister Beltoft

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)

■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a web-conference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection.

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Daniel Marzin.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting held on 14-16 January 2020, Parma

The minutes of the 15th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 31st January 2020.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.63Rev4 (EFSA-Q-2019-00401, EFSA-Q-2019-00453 to -00456, EFSA-Q-2019-00458, EFSA-Q-2019-00460, EFSA-Q-2019-00463 to -00465, EFSA-Q-2019-00475 to -00478)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

5.2. FGE.07Rev6 (EFSA-Q-2018-00838, EFSA-Q-2019-00451 and -00452)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

5.3. FGE.69Rev1 – (EFSA-Q-2019-00742 to -00744)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.4. FGE.76Rev2 (EFSA-Q-2014-00675 to -00679), FGE.21Rev6 (EFSA-Q-2014-00680 and -00681), FGE.93Rev2 (EFSA-Q-2014-00682 and EFSA-Q-2014-00683)

FGE.21Rev6 was not discussed due to lack of time. With respect to the substances 5-ethyl-4-methyl-2-(2-methylpropyl)-thiazoline [FL-no: 15.130] and 5-ethyl-4-methyl-2-(2-butyl)-thiazoline [FL-no:

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavouringsFAF.pdf



15.131] originally included in FGE.93, the WG considered that these can be evaluated in FGE.76Rev2 based on their structural similarities. The dossier will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

5 Any Other Business

None.

6 Next meeting

22-23 April 2020, web-conference.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 15TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 14-16 January 2020, Parma

(Agreed on 31 January 2020)

Participants

■ Working Group Members

Gabriele Aquilina, Romualdo Benigni, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes (Chair), Camilla Svendsen.

Claudia Bolognesi participated in agenda items 5.1 and 6

Rainer Gürtler participated via teleconference in agenda items 5.1 and 6

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Vibe Meister Beltoft

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE) participated via teleconference in agenda items 5.1 and 6

■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

SCER Unit: Daniela Maurici participated in agenda item 6

FEED Unit: Paola Manini participated in agenda item 6

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Peter Fürst and Trine Husøy.

Agneta Oskarsson resigned from the WG at the end of December 2019

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting held on 26-28 November 2019, Parma

The minutes of the 14th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 18th December 2019.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 FGE.72Rev2 (EFSA-Q-2018-00822, EFSA-Q-2018-00831 to -00837)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG. The revised draft opinion will be presented to the next FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

5.2 FGE.91Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2018-00839 and -00840)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavouringsFAF.pdf



5.4 FGE.63Rev4 (EFSA-Q-2019-00401, -00453 to-00458, -00460, -00463 to -00465, -00475 to -00478)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

6 Any Other Business

The WG had the opportunity to provide comments on the draft guidance on aneugenicity assessment, which is under preparation by the cross-cutting Working Group on Genotoxicity of the Scientific Committee. The comments provided will be shared with the cross-cutting Working Group on Genotoxicity at their next meeting (20 – 21 January 2020).

6 Next meeting

3-5 March 2020, Parma



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 14TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 26-28 November 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 18 December 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members

Gabriele Aquilina, Romualdo Benigni, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Paul Fowler, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes (Chair), Camilla Svendsen.

Rainer Gürtler participated via teleconference

Claudia Bolognesi participated in agenda items 5.1 and 5.2

Kevin Chipman participated in agenda items 5.1 and 6

Karl-Heinz Engel participated in agenda items 5

Agneta Oskarsson participated via teleconference in agenda items 5.1, 5.2 and 6

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Vibe Meister Beltoft

■ European Commission representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE) participated via teleconference

■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

Maria Carfi participated in agenda item 6

Alexandra Tard has participated in agenda item 5.1

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Peter Fürst and Trine Husøy.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting held on 24 October 2019, WEB-conference

The minutes of the 13th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 6th November 2019.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Prosmoke BW 01 (EFSA-Q-2019-00441)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.2 FGE.73Rev5 (EFSA-Q-2019-00302)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG. The revised draft opinion will be presented at the next FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

5.3 FGE.91Rev3 (EFSA-Q-2018-00839 and -00840)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavouringsFAF.pdf



5.4 FGE.72Rev2 (EFSA-Q-2018-00822, EFSA-Q-2018-00831 to -00837)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.5 FGE.07Rev6 (EFSA-Q-2018-00838, EFSA-Q-2019-00451, EFSA-Q-2019-00452)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

6 Any Other Business

6.1 Naringenin (EFSA-Q-2017-00001)

The WG took note of the applicant's reply to the request for additional information as agreed at the last WG meeting. A letter will be prepared by EFSA to reply to the comments from the applicant.

7 Next meeting

14-16 January 2020, Parma



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 13TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 24 October 2019 by teleconference

(Agreed on 06 November 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members

Kevin Chipman, Gisela Degen, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Wim Mennes (Chair), Agneta Oskarsson.

- EFSA:

FIP Unit: Stefania Barmaz, Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



4. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting held on 8-10 October 2019, Rome

The minutes of the 12th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 28th October 2019³.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. Naringenin (EFSA-Q-2017-00001)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

6. Any Other Business

None.

7. Next meeting

24-26 November 2019, Parma.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavouringsFAF.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 12TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 08-10 October 2019, Rome

(Agreed on 28 October 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members

Gabriele Aquilina, Romualdo Benigni, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes (Chair), Agneta Oskarsson, Camilla Svendsen.

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Vibe Meister Beltoft participated via teleconference

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)

■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

Camilla Smeraldi participated in agenda item 5.3

Stefania Barmaz participated via teleconference in agenda item 5.3

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Claudia Bolognesi, Peter Fürst, Trine Husøy.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting held on 19 September 2019, WEB-conference

The minutes of the 11th Working Group meeting were agreed on 2nd October 2019.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 FGE.61 Revision 2 (EFSA-Q-2018-00841 to -00843)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG. The revised draft opinion will be presented at the next FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

5.2 FGE.71 Revision 1 (EFSA-Q-2018-00863 to-00892)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG. The revised draft opinion will be presented at the next FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

5.3 Naringenin (EFSA-Q-2017-00001)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

5.4 FGE.73Rev5 (EFSA-Q-2019-00302)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

6 Any Other Business

None.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq_flavouringsFAF.pdf



7 Next meetings

24th October 2019, teleconference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 11TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 19 September 2019 by teleconference

(Agreed on 2nd October 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members
Wim Mennes, Romualdo Benigni, Rainer Gürtler, Karl-Heinz Engel, Gisela Degen and Agneta Oskarsson
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
None
- EFSA:
FIP Unit: Maria Carfì, Carla Martino, Esraa Elewa and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting held on 6 September 2019, teleconference

The minutes of the 10th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 19th September 2019⁴.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 FGE.61 Revision 2 (EFSA-Q-2018-00841 to -00843)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

5.2 FGE.91 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2018-00839 and EFSA-Q-2018-00840)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.3 FGE.73Rev5 (EFSA-Q-2019-00302)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

6. Any Other Business

None.

7. Next meeting

08-10th October 2019, Rome.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq_flavouringsFAF.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 10TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 6 September 2019 by teleconference

(Agreed on 19 September 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members
Gabriele Aquilina, Eugenia Cordelli, Rainer Gürtler, Daniel Marzin and Agneta Oskarsson
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
None
- EFSA:
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Kevin Chipman.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 25-26 June 2019, Parma

The minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 10th July 2019⁴.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 FGE.215 Revision 1 – subgroup 3.2 (EFSA-Q-2015-00180 to 00186)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG. The revised draft opinion will be presented to the FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

6 Any Other Business

None.

7 Next meeting

19th September 2019, teleconference.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq_flavouringsFAF.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 9TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 25-26 June 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 10 July 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members

Gabriele Aquilina, Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Rainer Gürtler, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes (Chair), Agneta Oskarsson, Camilla Svendsen.

Kevin Chipman has participated in agenda point 5.1

Peter Fürst has participated via teleconference

■ Hearing Experts¹:

Karin Nørby and Vibe Meister Beltoft

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE)

■ EFSA:

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

Stefania Barmaz participated in agenda item 5.1

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Trine Husøy.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 14-16 May 2019, Parma and of the 8th Working Group meeting held on 29 May 2019, WEB-conference

The minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 7th June 2019.⁴

The minutes of the 8th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 19th June 2019.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Naringenin (EFSA-Q-2017-00001)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.2 FGE.215 Revision 1 – subgroup 3.2 (EFSA-Q-2015-00180 to 00186)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

5.3 FGE.61 Revision 2 (EFSA-Q-2018-00841 to -00843)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.4 FGE.71 Revision 1 (EFSA-Q-2018-00863 to-00892)

This item was not discussed due to lack of time.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wq_flavouringsFAF.pdf



6 Any Other Business

None.

7 Next meetings

September 2019, teleconference (date to be confirmed).



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 8TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 29 May 2019 by teleconference

(Agreed on 19 June 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Kevin Chipman, Gisela Degen, Wim Mennes (Chair) and Agneta Oskarsson.
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
None
- EFSA:
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Rainer Gürtler.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 Naringenin (EFSA-Q-2017-00001)

The dossier was discussed by the WG and will be further evaluated at the next WG meeting.

5 Any Other Business

None.

6 Next meeting

25-26 June 2019, Parma.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 7TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 14-16 May 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 7 June 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members

Gabriele Aquilina, Claudia Bolognesi, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Paul Fowler, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes (Chair), Agneta Oskarsson, Camilla Svendsen.

Kevin Chipman has participated in agenda points 5.2

Rainer Gürtler has participated via teleconference, in agenda points 5.1, 5.5, 5.6

- Hearing Experts¹:

Karin Nørby and Vibe Meister Beltoft

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE) participated via teleconference

- EFSA:

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Romualdo Benigni, Karl-Heinz Engel, Peter Fürst and Trine Husøy.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work : <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 12-14 March 2019

The minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 4th April 2019.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 FGE.70 Revision 1 (EFSA-Q-2018-00648, EFSA-Q-2018-00652 to 00666, EFSA-Q-2018-00844 to -00849)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.2 FGE.410 Revision 1 - Naringenin (EFSA-Q-2017-00001)

The dossier was discussed by the WG and will be further evaluated at the next WG meeting.

5.3 FGE.05 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2018-00649 to -00651, EFSA-Q2018-00667, EFSA-Q-2018-00850 to -00862)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.4 FGE.204 Revision 1 – FGE.19 subgroup 1.2.1 (EFSA-Q-2015-00297 to -00312)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG. The revised draft opinion will be presented to the FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavouringsFAF.pdf



5.5 FGE.71 Revision 1 (EFSA-Q-2018-00863 to -00892)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.6 FGE.215 Revision 1 – subgroup 3.2 (EFSA-Q-2015-00180 to 00186)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

5.7 Smoke Flavouring Primary Product RS1003 (EFSA-Q-2015-00313)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

5.8 FGE.66 Revision 2 (EFSA-Q-2018-00994)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.9 FGE.61 Revision 2 (EFSA-Q-2018-00841 to -00843)

This item was not discussed due to lack of time.

6 Any Other Business

The WG was informed that the EFSA Scientific Committee Panel adopted the guidance on the use of the Threshold of Toxicological Concern approach in food safety assessment. The guidance will be published by the end of May.

7 Next meeting

29 May 2019, teleconference.

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 6TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 12-14 March 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 4 April 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members

Romualdo Benigni, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes (Chair), Agneta Oskarsson, Camilla Svendsen.

Claudia Bolognesi has participated in agenda point 5.5.

Rainer Gürtler has participated via teleconference, in agenda points 5.1, 5.2 and 5.5.

Karl-Heinz Engel has participated via teleconference, in agenda points 5.1 and 5.2.

- Hearing Experts¹:

Karin Nørby and Vibe Meister Beltoft

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE) participated via teleconference

- EFSA:

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

AMU Unit: José Cortinas Abrahantes has participated in agenda point 5.5

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Gabriele Aquilina, Gisela Degen, Paul Fowler, Peter Fürst and Trine Husøy.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 22-24 January 2019, Parma; 4th Working Group meeting held on 6th February 2019, WEB-conference and 5th Working Group meeting, 21st February, WEB-conference.

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 8th February 2019.⁴

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 25th February 2019.⁴

The minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting were agreed by written procedure on 8th March 2019.⁴

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1. FGE.501 – Grill flavour concentrate (vegetable) (EFSA-Q-2015-00821)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG. The revised draft opinion will be presented to the FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

5.2. FGE.210 Revision 3 – FGE.19 subgroup 2.4 (EFSA-Q-2016-00308 to - 00312)

The draft scientific opinion was discussed by the WG. The revised draft opinion will be presented to the FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/food-ingredients-and-packaging/wg_flavouringsFAF.pdf



5.3. FGE.70 Revision 1 (EFSA-Q-2018-00648, EFSA-Q-2018-00652 to -00666, EFSA-Q-2018-00844 to -00849)

The dossier was discussed by the WG. The draft scientific opinion will be presented to the FAF Panel meeting for presentation of the new proposed structure of the opinion and for discussion.

5.4. FGE.05 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2018-00649 to -00651, EFSA-Q-2018-00667, EFSA-Q-2018-00850 to -00862)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5.5. FGE.204 Revision 1 – FGE.19 subgroup 1.2.1 – (EFSA-Q-2015-00297 to -00312)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next WG meeting.

6. Any Other Business

None.

7. Next meeting

14-16 May 2019, Parma



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 5TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on WEB-conference, 21 February 2019

(Agreed on 08 March 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Wim Mennes (Chair) and Camilla Svendsen.
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
None
- EFSA:
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Elewa Esraa, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. FGE.501 – Grill flavour concentrate (vegetable) (EFSA-Q-2015-00821)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting(s)

12-14 March 2019, Parma.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD ADDITIVES AND FLAVOURINGS (FAF)

MINUTES OF THE 4TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FLAVOURINGS

Held on 6 February 2019 by teleconference

(Agreed on 25 February 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Daniel Marzin and Wim Mennes (Chair)
- Hearing Experts¹:
None
- European Commission representative:
None
- EFSA:
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Esraa Elewa, Carla Martino and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1 FGE.210 Revision 3 – FGE.19 subgroup 2.4 (EFSA-Q-2016-00308 to - 00312)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting

21st February 2019, teleconference.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings (FAF)

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 22-24 January 2019, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 8 February 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen (participated in agenda points 4.1 to 4.3), Karl-Heinz Engel, Rainer Gürtler, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes (Chair), Camilla Svendsen.

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Karin Nørby and Vibe Meister Beltoft

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANTE) participated via teleconference

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Paul Fowler, Peter Fürst, Trine Husøy and Agneta Oskarsson.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 FGE.210 Revision 3 – FGE.19 subgroup 2.4 (EFSA-Q-2016-00308 to -00312)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

4.2 FGE.501 – Grill Flavour (EFSA-Q-2015-00821)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at a next WG meeting.

4.3 FGE.70 Revision 1 (EFSA-Q-2018-00648, EFSA-Q-2018-00652 to -00666, EFSA-Q-2018- 00844 to -00849)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

4.4 FGE.05 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2018-00649 to -00651, EFSA-Q-2018-00667, EFSA-Q-2018-00850 to – 00862)

This item was not discussed due to lack of time.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

5. Any Other Business

The Chair presented to the WG the EFSA software for the estimation of the Benchmark dose.

6. Next meeting

6th February 2019, teleconference.

Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings (FAF)

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 19-21 November 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 7 December 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Eugenia Cordelli, Gisela Degen, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes, Agneta Oskarsson, Camilla Svendsen, Paul Fowler.

Kevin Chipman has participated via teleconference in agenda points 4.3 and 4.4

Karl-Heinz Engel has participated in agenda points 4.2, 4.3 and 4.4.

Peter Furst has participated via teleconference in agenda point 4.1

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

Karin Nørby and Vibe Meister Beltoft

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANCO) has participated in agenda points 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, 5.1 and 5.2.

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Trine Husøy and Rainer Gürtler.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 FGE.208 Revision 3 – FGE.19 subgroup 2.2 (EFSA-Q-2018-00618)

The draft scientific opinion was presented by the rapporteur and discussed. The revised draft opinion will be presented to the FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

4.2 FGE.217 Revision 2 – FGE.19 subgroup 4.1 (EFSA-Q-2013-00286, EFSA-Q-2014-00425 to -00433)

The draft scientific opinion was presented by the rapporteur and discussed. The revised draft opinion will be presented to the FAF Panel meeting for possible adoption.

4.3 FGE.67 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00853 to -00859, EFSA-Q-2014-00388, EFSA-Q-2014-00389, EFSA-Q-2014-00416 to -00420)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4.4 FGE.13 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to -00422) - Furfuryl and furan derivatives

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

5. Any Other Business

5.1. Mixture of 3- and 4-butylthiophene-2-carbaldehyde (EFSA-Q-2018-00252)

Further to the request for additional information agreed by the WG at its previous meeting and sent by EFSA to the applicant, regarding the evaluation of the new flavouring substance (3) and (4)-butylthiophene-2-carbaldehyde, the WG was made aware of the fact that the applicant has expressed willingness to withdraw its dossier for evaluation. Pending receipt of the official withdrawal of the mandate from the EC, assessment of this dossier will be placed on hold.

5.2. 2-Hexyl-2-decenal, 2-Octyl-2-dodecenal, 2-Butyl-2-octenal (EFSA-Q-2018-00251, EFSA-Q-2018-00409 and EFSA-Q-2018-00410)

Further to the request for additional information agreed by the WG at its previous meeting and sent by EFSA to the applicant, regarding the evaluation of new flavouring substances 2-Hexyl-2-decenal, 2-Butyl-2-octenal and 2-Octyl-2-dodecenal, the WG was made aware of the fact that the applicant has expressed willingness to withdraw its dossier for evaluation. Pending receipt of the official withdrawal of the mandate from the EC, assessment of this dossier will be placed on hold.

6. Next meeting

22 -24 January, Parma.

Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings (FAF)

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Flavourings

Held on 15-17th October 2018, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 7 November 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Romualdo Benigni, Claudia Bolognesi, Kevin Chipman, Eugenia Cordelli, Rainer Gürtler, Daniel Marzin, Wim Mennes, Agneta Oskarsson, Camilla Svendsen.

Karl-Heinz Engel has participated via teleconference in agenda point 5.1 and 5.2

Paul Fowler has participated in agenda point 4.1, 4.2, 4.5 and 4.6

Peter Fürst has participated in agenda point 4.1, 4.2, 4.4, 4.5 and 4.6

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

None

- **European Commission representative:**

Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell (DG SANCO) has participated via teleconference in agenda point 4.3

- **EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Natalia Kovalkovičová, Carla Martino, Camilla Smeraldi and Giorgia Vianello

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Gisela Degen, Trine Husøy and Christina Tlustos.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

4.1 Mixture of (3) and (4)-butylthiophene-2-carbaldehyde (EFSA-Q-2018-00252)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

4.2 2-Hexyl-2-decenal, 2-Octyl-2-dodecenal, 2-Butyl-2-octenal (EFSA-Q-2018-00251, EFSA-Q-2018-00409 and EFSA-Q-2018-00410)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

4.3 FGE.208 Revision 3 – FGE.19 subgroup 2.2 (EFSA-Q-2018-00618)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next meeting.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

4.4 FGE.222 Revision 1 - FGE.19 subgroup 4.6 (EFSA-Q-2014-00436 to 00441)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

4.5 FGE.217 Revision 2 – FGE.19 Subgroup 4.1 (EFSA-Q-2013-00286, EFSA-Q-2014-00425 to -00433)

The dossier was discussed and will be further evaluated at the next meeting.

4.6 FGE.76Rev.2 (EFSA-Q-2014-00675 to -00679), FGE.21Rev.6 (EFSA-Q-2014-00680 and EFSA-Q-2014-00681), FGE.93Rev.2 (EFSA-Q-2014-00682 and EFSA-Q-2014-00683)

The WG considered the available data and concluded that these are not sufficient to complete the risk assessment. The scientific evaluation will be suspended awaiting additional information.

4.7 FGE.67 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2013-00853 to -00859, EFSA-Q-2014-00388, EFSA-Q-2014-00389, EFSA-Q-2014-00416 to -00420)

This item was not discussed due to lack of time.

4.8 FGE.13 Revision 3 (EFSA-Q-2014-00421 to -00422) - Furfuryl and furan derivatives

This item was not discussed due to lack of time.

5. Any Other Business

None.

6. Next meeting

19-21 November 2018, Parma